



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

IX.—*Anaphora and Chiasmus in Livy.*

By DR. R. B. STEELE,

VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY.

THE importance of the study of anaphora and chiasmus is set forth by Nägelsbach-Müller, *Lat. Stilistik*⁸, p. 652, "Wir sind daher der festen Überzeugung dass jede fruchtbare und lehrbare Doktrin von der lat. Wortstellung in der Periode erst an der Lehre von diesen Figuren einen festen und vernünftigen Halt gewinnt, ja dass sie mit derselben im Grunde schon gegeben ist." Anaphora is here taken as it is defined, p. 634, "Freilich muss nicht nur . . . ein logischer und grammatischer Chiasmus und in letzterem wieder die Kreuzung der Worte von der der Sätze unterschieden, sondern namentlich die Anaphora in viel weiterer Ausdehnung als bisher anerkannt und nicht blos als Wiederholung des selben Wortes am Anfang eines neuen Satzes, sondern als Wiederkehr der nämlichen Wortfolge gefasst werden." As the counterpart of chiasmus, the term anaphora should be used as a synonym of parallelism in sentence development, but in the present paper we shall consider the subject in its restricted sense,—the repetition of the same word in successive statements. This we may term verbal anaphora, as opposed to clausal anaphora,—the repetition of groups of words in parallel construction. But all forms of repetition of words are not to be considered as anaphoric. Some forms of correlation may be considered as stereotyped anaphorisms of a special form, differing from ordinary examples of anaphora in the fact that the first indicates the addition of a corresponding term. It is for this reason that many common forms of expression, *e.g.* *nec* . . . *nec*, *sive* . . . *sive*, and *vel* . . . *vel* should be considered in a discussion of correlation rather than of anaphora.

The discussion of chiasmus will be limited to its grammatical phase,—the change of the relative order of the successive

parts of a sentence which are grammatically coördinate, or at least grammatically equivalent. While the limitations set to the lines of investigation render the presentation, in a way, unsymmetrical, yet the use of the figures is a part of the conscious rhetorical art of Livy, and by considering the parts of speech separately, there can be shown, both for anaphora and chiasmus, the relative importance of the different verbal elements in the rhetorical development of the period.

I.

ANAPHORA.

The rhetorical character of verbal anaphora is shown by the fact that it is a marked feature in the speeches reported either directly or indirectly by Livy. In these is to be found a large proportion of the nouns, verbs, and interrogative and conditional statements used in anaphora. In these, emphasis was sought by the repetition of some one verbal element, the recurrence indicating its importance as viewed by the writer or supposed speaker. As a good illustration of this may be taken 40, 15 in the first twelve lines of which are found *cur . . . cur . . . cur, haec . . . haec . . . haec . . . haec . . . haec, nec . . . nec, quia . . . quia, nec . . . nec, indignus . . . indignus*. While this form of rhetorical expression is most noticeable in the parts assigned by Livy to others, some of the finest examples are to be found in what purports to be the words of Livy himself. As illustrations may be given 28, 12, 3 *quibus non lex, non mos, non lingua communis, alius habitus, alia vestis, alia arma, alii ritus, alia sacra, alii prope dei essent*; and 30, 33, 8 *quibus non lingua, non mos, non lex, non arma, non vestitus habitusque, non causa militandi eadem esset*. However, when these sentences were written, Livy probably had in mind the words of Polybius 11, 19, 4 *οὐσ οὐ νόμος, οὐκ ἔθος, οὐ λόγος, οὐχ ἔτερον οὐδὲν ἡν κοινὸν ἐκ φύσεως πρὸς ἀλλήλους*.

Though emphasis is the end sought in the repetition of independent elements, there are numerous instances in which the anaphora must be considered as dependent, and due to

limitations in verbal expression, or to some prevailing form of statement. Of these, three are noticeable, and may be termed (1) genderic, (2) partitive, and (3) prepositional.

1. **Genderic.** — When there is a succession of nouns in different genders modified by a common attributive element, the easiest way to avoid difficulties connected with ‘agreement in gender’ is to repeat the modifier with each noun. A few examples will sufficiently illustrate the hundred instances in Livy of this kind of repetition: 1, 35, 5 *Romana se iura, Romanos ritus didicisse*; 2, 49, 6 *omnia praemia ab se, omnes honores sperare*; 4, 28, 7 *multa vulnera, multa caedes*; 27, 44, 5 *duo bella, . . . duos ingentis exercitus, duos prope Hannibales in Italia esse*; 2, 44, 9 *suos cuique parti magistratus, suas leges esse*; 3, 48, 8 *eamne liberorum procreandorum condicionem, ea pudicitiae praenia esse?* In the passages where the same word occurs three times, as in 37, 9, 2 *gravia hiberna navium erant, grave tributum, . . . gravis etiam inopia frumenti*, and in some where it occurs but twice, there is an evident emphasis, but in most instances there is none.

2. **Partitive.** — The repetition of the pronoun is frequently due to the need of distinguishing between the parts of the subject under discussion. Repetition is necessary in such passages which must be carefully distinguished from those in which the relatives refer to a common antecedent, and in which the anaphora might have been avoided, as in 1, 53, 3 *concepit animo eam amplitudinem Iovis templi, quae digna deum hominumque rege, quae Romano imperio, quae ipsius etiam loci maiestate esset*. As examples of the partitive class may be quoted 1, 54, 7 *quae dixerit ipse quaeque viderit refert*; 4, 52, 5 *qui Etruscum mare quique Tiberim accolunt*, and 23, 13, 8 *qui in Italia quique in Hispania essent*. Other classes of pronouns are of more frequent occurrence. There is an occasional instance of *quidam . . . quidam*, but much more common are *alter . . . alter* and *alii . . . alii*. Of the former, Fügner, *Lex. Liv.*, pp. 966–971, gives 77 instances anaphoric, while six are chiastic. *Alii . . . alii* are anaphoric in 162 passages, and chiastic in seven. In but a small part

of the passages do the words occur more than twice (see Fügner, p. 945), though in 44, 34, 8 *alii* is used six times.

3. **Prepositional.**—In Livy the preposition is regularly repeated when the nouns are connected by *et*, though 118 passages were noticed in which the connectives are omitted and the preposition repeated, giving a statement differing rhetorically somewhat from the normal with the conjunction expressed; and yet the preposition is an element so weak that these examples must be classed as instances of dependent anaphora. While this is true, the phrases themselves may be emphatic because of the force of the nouns with which the prepositions are used, *e.g.* 2, 32, 7 *eam per aequa, per iniqua reconciliandam civitatem esse*; 26, 12, 14 *sic ad Cannas, sic ad Trasumennum rem bene gestam*; 39, 40, 11 *in parsimonia, in patientia laboris et periculi*. . . . While the affirmative prepositions are not usually emphatic, the negative character of *sine* makes it emphatic, and in the 30 passages where it is repeated, the emphasis is on the repeated preposition, *e.g.* 7, 13, 6 *exercitum tuum sine animis, sine armis, sine manibus iudicas esse*; 9, 5, 10 *se solos sine vulnere, sine ferro, sine acie victos*.

NEGATIVES.

The use of negatives in anaphora is frequent enough to justify a brief consideration apart from the affirmative statements. While the larger part are instances of the repetition of *non*, the occurrence of other words is noticeable.

1. **Non.**—The best illustrations of *non* in anaphora are 5, 6, 17 *quoniam ea demum Romae libertas est, non senatum, non magistratus, non leges, non mores maiorum, non instituta patrum, non disciplinam vereri militiae*; 28, 42, 6 *Africo bello . . . ubi non portus ullus classi nostrae apertus, non ager pacatus; non civitas socia, non rex amicus; non consistendi usquam locus, non procedendi*; and 30, 33, 8 quoted, p. 2, l. 20. *Non* occurs five times in 26, 48, 4; 40, 10, 3; 45, 43, 2; four times 1, 47, 10; 27, 16, 1; and three times in a dozen passages. Noticeable in three passages is the occurrence of other negatives with *non*: 8, 34, 7 *cum polluta semel*

militari disciplina non miles centurionis, non centurio tribuni, non legatus consulis, non magister equitum dictatoris pareat imperio, nemo hominum, deorum verecundiam habeat, non edicta imperatorum, non auspicia observentur, sine commeatu, vagi milites in pacato, in hostico errent, inmemores sacramenti . . . ; 5, 38, 1 ibi tribuni militum non loco castris ante capto, non praemunito vallo, quo receptus esset, non deorum saltem, si non hominum memores, nec auspicato nec litato instruunt aciem ; 34, 7, 7 non magistratus nec sacerdotia nec triumphi nec insignia nec dona aut spolia bellica iis contingere possunt. Ninety-three passages were noticed in which *non* is anaphoric. In a few of these it is used with contrasted terms, as in 3, 11, 6 non lingua, non manu ; 9, 34, 15 non die, non hora ; 21, 11, 5 and 32, 15, 2 non nocte, non die ; 30, 42, 19 non terra, non mari. At times the negative is used with the ablative absolute : 1, 15, 2 itaque non castris positis, non expectato hostium exercitu ; 41, 10, 5 non votis nuncupatis, non paludatis lictoribus ; 45, 21, 4 non ante consulto senatu, non consulibus certioribus factis. In other instances there is a variation in the form of statement, as 1, 47, 10 : non interregno, ut antea, inito, non comitiis habitis, non per suffragium populi, non auctoribus patribus, muliebri dono regnum occupasse. In general it may be said that the particular part of speech, with the negative, is not of moment, for this is merely incidental to the phase of the subject under consideration.

Other negatives with adverbial, adjectival, or nominal force are found as follows :

2. **Numquam.** — 9, 19, 15 numquam ab equite hostile, numquam a pedite, numquam aperta acie, numquam aequis, utique numquam nostris locis laborabimus.

3. **Parum.** — 8, 32, 16 cum parum precibus, parum causa proficerent ; 45, 37, 11 parum licentiae, parum avaritia.

4. **Nemo.** — 4, 4, 8 nemo plebeius patriciae virgini vim adferret ; . . . nemo pactionem . . . coegisset ; 4, 5, 6 nemo est nomen daturus, nemo arma capturus, nemo dimicaturus pro superbis dominis ; 9, 34, 6 ; 27, 5, 3 neminem Carthaginensem in Sicilia esse ; neminem Siculum . . . non esse ;

omnis in urbes, in agros suos reductos arare ; 28, 20, 6 ; 28, 43, 11 nemo se ostenderet praeter me ; nemo profiteri ausus esset ; 25, 6, 16.

5. **Nihil.** — *Nihil* is used in anaphora with about the same frequency : 2, 9, 3 nihil excelsum, nihil, quod supra cetera emineat, in civitatibus fore ; 2, 54, 2 ; 28, 30, 8 ; 29, 3, 14 ; 40, 8, 18 ; 40, 14, 5. In 21, 4, 9 the anaphora is continued by the use of another negative : nihil veri, nihil sancti, nullus deum metus, nullum ius iurandum, nulla religio.

6. **Nullus.** — The last quotation contains *nullus* three times, and other occurrences are 3, 10, 14 nullum terrorem externum, nullum periculum esse ; 6, 28, 1 ; 7, 40, 7 ; 34, 11, 7 ; 38, 53, 4 ; 39, 1, 6.

7. **Ne.** — *Ne* is sometimes repeated with negative commands indirectly stated, as in 4, 4, 6 ne adfinitatibus, ne propinquitatibus, immisceamur, cavent, ne societur, and 41, 23, 7 decretum . . . ne legatos, ne nuntios admitteremus, but in most instances there is a verb for each negative, e.g. 1, 13, 2 ne se sanguine nefando soceri generique respergerent, ne parricidio macularent partus suos ; 3, 10, 14 caveant ne possessione urbis pellantur, ne iugum accipient. There are also a few instances of the repetition of negative final clauses, as 21, 63, 8 fugisse ne . . . adiret, ne . . . videret consuleretque, ne Latinas indiceret . . . , ne auspicio profectus . . . iret.

ADVERBS.

Exclusive of those particles which have come to be used as correlatives, such as *iam* . . . *iam*, *tum* . . . *tum*, etc., adverbs are not freely used in anaphora. *Bis* is repeated 7, 40, 6 ; 8, 30, 7 ; 38, 46, 2 bis cum iis pugnatum est, bis loco iniquo subiit. *Male* occurs 9, 34, 2 obruerent eum male parta, male gesta, male retenta imperia ; *segniter* . . . *segniter* 10, 35, 17 ; and *temere* 6, 13, 1 temere proelium iniit, temere omisit. Other examples contain adverbs of time or of place.

1. **Time.** — *Saepe* occurs 10, 45, 12 saepe in acie, saepe in agmine, saepe circa urbem ; 34, 4, 1 ; and with the comparative 3, 69, 3 plena honorum saepe gestorum, saepius meriti-

torum. Single occurrences of other adverbs are as follows : 29, 17, 16 cotidie capitur urbs nostra, cotidie deripitur ; 4, 37, 11 nondum fuga certa, nondum victoria erat ; 10, 36, 2 prius impetus, prius clamor inciperet. There is an instance of *quotiens . . . quotiens* 38, 47, 12 ; and of *totiens . . . totiens* 10, 39, 15, and 35, 45, 6 *totiens legationibus missis Romam, totiens cum ipso Quinctio disceptando satis expertum esse.*

2. **Place.** — *Hic, ibi, inde, ubi,* and *unde* are the adverbs of place used in anaphora, the last chiefly in questions. *Hic* is found in 9, 4, 11 ; 21, 43, 10 ; and 5, 54, 7, where it occurs five times. *Ibi* is repeated 23, 45, 4 *ibi virtutem bellicam, ibi militarem disciplinam, ibi praeteriti temporis famam, ibi spem futuri extinctam* ; 26, 42, 3 ; 27, 48, 9 ; and 31, 24, 12 *ibi signa, ibi aciem esse debere, ubi rex esset.* *Inde* is occasionally repeated, as in 27, 9, 11 ; 35, 12, 7, and 42, 61, 5. Anaphorisms containing *ubi* are in 1, 6, 3 *ubi expositi ubique educati erant* ; 39, 43, 4 ; and 39, 4, 9, where it occurs four times. *Unde* is rarely repeated outside of questions, as in 1, 8, 3 *unde sella curulis, unde toga praetexta sumpta est.*

ADJECTIVES.

The repetition of adjectives is frequently due, as has been shown, to a difference in gender of the nouns which they modify. The anaphoric use of numerals is due to the desire to keep clearly distinct the integral character of the nouns. There is often a difference in gender, but nouns of the same gender are at times modified by numerals, as in 1, 28, 7 *unam urbem, unam rem publicam, and in different genders, but with the same ending for the numeral as in 40, 46, 8 uno animo, uno consilio.* *Quantus* and *tantus* occur each half a dozen times, *quot* three times as in 26, 41, 10 *quot classes, quot duces, quot exercitus priore bello amissi sunt ! and tot* fourteen times as in 30, 30, 7 *pro tot classibus, tot exercitibus, tot tam egregiis amissis ducibus.* Other instances of adjectives arranged in anaphora are of the same general character, and can be sufficiently illustrated by a few examples : 3, 69, 3 *priores patrum dignam dicere contionem imperio consulari,*

dignam tot consulatibus ante, actis, dignam vita omni ; 33, 41, 7 multae fractae, multae naves eiectae, multae haustae mari.

NOUNS.

The anaphoric arrangement of nouns is not of frequent occurrence. Instances of partitive anaphora are 2, 41, 1; 4, 2, 6; and 33, 30, 7, where *dimidius* is used. Other occurrences are *animus* 22, 60, 22; *auspiciis* 6, 41, 4; *virtute* 7, 35, 3; *deos* 6, 1, 19; *equites* 42, 61, 5; *patres* 2, 24, 2; *regem* 35, 42, 9; *veniam* 8, 35, 2. Proper names are repeated in the following : 21, 43, 4 circa Padus amnis, maior Padus ac violentior Rhodano ; 45, 38, 7 Literni domicilium et sedem fuisse domitoris Africæ, Literni sepulchrum ostendi erubescamus ; 1, 28, 6 Mettius ille est ductor itineris huius, Mettius idem huius machinator belli, Mettius foederis Romani Albanique ruptor. In the last there is a combination of anaphora and chiasmus, *Mettius* holding its place at the head of each clause, while the other words form chiasmus, with the order 1234, 1423, 1342.

PRONOUNS.

The different classes of pronouns are fairly well represented in anaphora though some of them are found only in the speeches. Those most commonly occurring are the possessives of the third person, and other forms which are used adjectively.

I. Personal. — Pronouns of the first person are limited to 28, 28, 11 si ego morerer, mecum expiratura res publica, mecum casurum imperium populi Romani erat? 3, 67, 11 adversus nos Aventinum capitur, adversus nos Sacer occupatur mons ; and 1, 13, 3 nos causa belli, nos volnerum ac caedium viris ac parentibus sumus. Pronouns of the second person are somewhat more frequently used, anaphorically. *Tu* is found 43, 14, 6, and *te* 40, 15, 10, and with variation in case 7, 13, 10 cum vincere cupimus tum te duce vincere, tibi lauream insignem deferre, tecum triumphantes urbem inire, tuum sequentes currum . . . adire. The plural is found 1, 32, 10; 7, 30, 19; 21, 44, 2, and three times with variation

in construction, 10, 8, 9 penes vos auspicia esse, vos solos gentem habere, vos solos iustum imperium et auspicium domi militiaeque. *Secum* is found in a speech indirectly quoted 4, 32, 5 proinde memores secum triumphos, secum spolia, secum victoriam esse . . . arma caperent.

2. **Possessive.** — Instances were noticed of *noster* 23, 42, 2; of *meus* 42, 41, 13; and of *tuus* 5, 21, 2 and 34, 4, 18. *Vester* anaphoric is found in five passages, and *suis* in seventeen, the nouns in most of the passages differing in gender.

3. **Demonstrative.** — Twenty-nine instances of *hic* anaphoric were noticed, and nine of *ille*. The characterization of the Claudian family 9, 34 has "haec est eadem familia," then *haec* six times followed by "hoc est nomen." *Haec* occurs five times, but with variation in statement, 40, 15, 3; and four times 1, 32, 8, and 3, 72, 3. The best illustration of *ille* is in 27, 49, 3 *ille* . . . sustinuit, *ille* . . . accedit, *ille* . . . restituit. Of the eleven occurrences of anaphoric *is*, all are used attributively excepting in 2, 2, 6 *regium genus, regium nomen . . . esse, id officere, id obstare libertati*; and 8, 31, 4 *et nunc id furere, id aegre pati, quod . . . fuerint*. Similar to these are two of the twenty instances of repeated *idem*: 22, 39, 18, and 27, 9, 14 *idem alias colonias facturas, idem socios*.

4. **Relative.** — Relative forms are the most numerous, 135 instances, including both simple and compound forms. In nearly all the passages the relatives refer to a common antecedent, *e.g.* 39, 36, 13 *nostrum est, quod evocavimus ad causam dicendam eos, qui ad arma multitudinem exciverant, qui expugnaverant maritima oppida, qui diripuerant, qui caedem principum fecerant*.

Of the entire number — 122 — a small part belongs to the partitive class, and in ten passages the relatives are in different cases as in 6, 20, 6 *homines prope quadringentos produxisse dicitur, quibus sine faenore expensas pecunias tulisset, quorum bona venire, quos duci addictos prohibuisset*. The differentiation of subjects and indirect objects causes the repetition of *aliquid* in 42, 39, 4 *aliquid illi regiae maiestati, hi aliquid populi Romani nomini . . . existimabant deberi*, though, as quoted, there is chiasmus — *aliquid illi . . . hi aliquid*. Of

the examples in which the pronoun follows *ne*, by far the most striking is 25, 6, 18 *relegati sumus . . . ne qua spes, ne qua occasio abolendae ignominiae, ne qua placandae civium irae, ne qua denique bene moriendi sit.* Other compounds are found in a few passages, *e.g.* 1, 25, 1 *quicquid civium domi, quicquid in exercitu sit*; 25, 29, 6 *quo quisquis terra quisquis mari venerit*; 39, 16, 2 *quidquid his annis libidine, quidquid fraude, quidquid scelere peccatum est, ex illo uno sacrario scitote ortum esse.*

5. Interrogative. — Interrogative forms are less numerous than are the relatives. The most striking of the forty-three instances of *quid* anaphoric is in 28, 27, 12 *quid facinoris in me, quid in patriam . . . quid in deos . . . quid adversus auspicia, . . . quid adversus morem militiae disciplinamque maiorum, quid adversus summi imperii maiestatem ausi sitis.* The pronoun with adjectival force occurs 49 times, and, as with other adjectives, the form frequently varies to suit the gender of the nouns, as in 6, 23, 6 *quam occasionem, quod tempus, quem insidiis instruendis locum?* and 27, 45, 6 *cernere ipsos, quo concursu, qua admiratione, quo favore hominum iter suum celebretur.* *Quisnam* is used in like manner 7, 34, 13 *quaenam illa inscitia belli ac pigritia est, aut quonam modo isti . . . victoriam pepererunt;* 22, 7, 14 *quonam duce aut quibus copiis;* 24, 27, 5 *quonam . . . quove;* and in strict parallelism 6, 40, 18 *quaenam ista societas, quaenam consortio est?*

VERBS.

Fifty-five instances were observed of different forms of the verb used in anaphora, the most noticeable being 25, 6, 22 *vis tu mari, vis terra, vis acie, vis urbibus oppugnandis experiri virtutem?* 40, 9, 8 *huic spei tuae obstat aetas mea, obstat gentium ius, obstat vetustus Macedoniae mos, obstat vero etiam patris iudicium;* 42, 11, 6 *florere . . . florere . . . florere;* 29, 17, 18 *nego . . . nego . . . nego;* 9, 8, 9 *vidisse . . . vidisse . . . videre;* 40, 13, 2 *volui . . . volui . . . volui.* There is a combination of anaphora and chiasmus 5, 7, 10 *laudare equites, laudare plebem, diem ipsum laudibus*

ferre. In each of the remaining passages the verb occurs but twice, as in 4, 5, 2 minaberis plebi, minaberis tribuno? and with the verb sometimes in the imperative: 2, 55, 7 adeste cives, adeste commitones; 26, 41, 23 traducite Hiberum, traducite in terras . . . saepe a vobis paragratas. In eleven passages participial forms were noticed, usually showing distinction of gender, as in 28, 18, 10 relicta provincia . . . relictis exercitibus; and 30, 28, 6 pervagatos capta castra, captas urbes Romanas.

PARTICLES.

The use in anaphora of some of the classes of particles — comparative, conditional, interrogative, and temporal — is noticeable, and the heaping up of *sic* and *ita*, *si* and *nisi*, *cur* and *an*, *cum* and *dum*, sharpen many a point in the speeches. The attention of the listener is fixed by setting forth similar details of the topic under consideration, and by striking the same verbal key from three to six times, or even more, as in 4, 5, 5, where *si* occurs eight times within a single sentence.

1. **Comparative.** — The particles *ita*, *sic*, *ut*, *prout*, *tam* and *quam* are occasionally anaphoric. In the 45 instances observed, the following occur three or four times: In 9, 17, 11, and 32, 21, 13, *ita* is used four times. In 38, 40, 14 is found *prout* locus, . . . *prout* animus pugnantium est, *prout* numerus, . . . varia fortuna pugnae est; 38, 46, 10 *sic* . . . *sic* . . . *sic* . . . *sic*; and three times 6, 17, 2, and 28, 8, 3. *Tam* occurs four times, 45, 37, 1; and three are found in 42, 5, 5. In one of the nine passages containing *quam* anaphoric, the word appears three times in 8, 31, 6 neque illum magistro equitum infestiore quam tribunis militum, quam centurionibus, quam militibus esse. Here also may be placed an example of split *antequam* 5, 51, 7 num ante exorta est, quam spreta vox caelo emissā . . . quam ius gentium . . . violatum, quam a nobis . . . praetermissum?

2. **Conditional.** — *Si* and *nisi* are frequently repeated, especially in the speeches, and emphasis is thereby added by keeping before the auditor, by repetition, the conditional coloring

of the statement. At times the anaphoric arrangement is continued to considerable length by dwelling upon the items under consideration. Examples, showing the extension to long statements, are : 1, 13, 2 si *ad finitatis inter vos, si conubii piget, in nos vertite iras*; 2, 54, 6 si *se commoverit, si respexerit, si . . . crediderit, . . . proponat*; 7, 40, 8 ac *si cui genus, si cui sua virtus, si cui etiam maiestas, si cui honores subdere spiritus potuerunt, iis eram natus, . . . id . . . ea*; 9, 9, 6 si *spondissemus urbem hanc relictum populum Romanum? si incensurum? si magistratus, si senatum, si leges non habiturum? si sub regibus futurum?* Still more noticeable is 4, 5, 5.

3. **Interrogative.**—Questions of all kinds are freely used in the speeches, and, in addition to the anaphorisms with interrogative pronouns, there are 36 others in which are included ten with *ubi*, e.g. 7, 15, 2 *ubi illi clamores sint arma possentium, ubi minae iniussu imperatoris proelium inituros?* and a few with *unde*, e.g. 2, 23, 5 *sciscitantibus unde ille habitus, unde deformitas.* The most noticeable instances of the anaphoric use of *cur* are in 34, 6, 17; 28, 29, 2, and 40, 15, 2, where there are three or four complete questions, as in 28, 43, 13, where *utrum . . . an . . . an . . . an* are used. A few examples will be quoted of particles repeated within a complete question : 2, 34, 9 *cur ego plebeios magistratus, cur Sicinium potentem video*; 3, 67, 10 *ecquando unam urbem habere, ecquando communem hanc esse patriam licebit?*

4. **Temporal.**—Temporal particles not used interrogatively appear in anaphora, as in 28, 43, 10, where *cum* is used six times; in 22, 60, 25 four; and in 34, 7, 5 and 34, 13, 8 three. *Dum* is found three times in 3, 10, 13; 21, 53, 9; 22, 60, 10; 24, 24, 2; 26, 44, 11; 28, 44, 10; 31, 15, 4.

In addition to the classes already considered, there are a few instances in which the introductory particle is repeated in other kinds of clauses, though repetition is usually the result of the general form of the statement. As illustrations of independent anaphora will be given 4, 3, 8 *quod spiratis, quod vocem mittitis, quod formas hominum habetis, indignantur*; 34, 6, 14 *cautum erat, quo ne plus auri et argenti facti, quo*

ne plus signati argenti et aeris domi haberemus ; 29, 34, 2 Syphacem orant, ut Carthagini, ut universae Africæ subveniat.

Considering as a whole the entire number of instances observed, independent elements as verbs and nouns are not freely used. With attributive elements the repetition is often due to the exigencies of gender, while the particles are repeated to hold the mind of the auditor to the same perceptive angle by emphasizing some particular phase of the subject.

II.

CHIASMUS.

The criss-cross arrangement of words is a common phenomenon in Latin, and from Livy we have collected 1257 examples. Following the same method as in the discussion of anaphora, we shall give an outline of Livy's chiastic treatment of the different parts of speech in successive pairs of words, as well as in longer groups within the same sentence, and shall consider chiasmus as a conscious arrangement of the parts immediately in the writer's view in the organization of the sentence as a stylistic unit.

ADVERBS.

When chiasmus occurs with successive pairs of words containing adverbs, the latter are usually arranged as the means, 85 out of the entire 97 occupying this position. It is worthy of note that 74 are adverbs of time, and that of these, 53 are instances of *prius*, *primo* or *primum* with *dein* or *deinde*; and that there are 14 others differing from these only in the fact that *dein* or *deinde* is displaced by an equivalent (*inde* five times, *mox* three, *postremo* and *tum* twice, *post* and *hinc* once each). Seven passages were noticed in which other temporal adverbs or their equivalents form the means. Two of these, 10, 11, 12 and 34, 2, 7 have *quondam*, *nunc*; 36, 17, 13 *ante*, *nunc*; in one passage the reading is uncertain, 44, 36, 2 *adscesserunt tum * * * mox adparebat*; and an adverbial equivalent occurs in 2, 47, 11 *spreta in tempore gloria inter-*

dum cumulatior rediit; 6, 26, 8 pacem in praesentia nec ita multo post civitatem etiam impetraverunt; and 38, 15, 15 ad Anabura inde, et altero die ad Alandri fontes posuit castra.

The five passages in which temporal adverbs form the extremes of the chiasmus are as follows: 3, 62, 8 aequato primum periculo, pudore deinde animos peditum accidunt; 5, 15, 5 primo velut temere iactum sperni, agitari deinde sermonibus coeptum est; 37, 27, 4 quas primo ex classe regia praetor esse ratus institit sequi; apparuit deinde piraticos celoces esse; 38, 43, 4 agros primum depopulatos . . . obssessos deinde et oppugnatos se; 33, 16, 8 primo murmur ac fremitus admirantium, silentium mox a verecundia . . . ortum est. In all of these the second adverb is postpositive, and in this respect the form of statement differs from that in which the adverbs are placed together. The contrast between *sperni* and *agitari*, *murmur* and *silentium*, accounts for their position, and the wide separation of the adverbs, or difference in grammatical structure may explain the divergence, in the other examples, from the normal chiastic arrangement.

The remaining 23 passages have, for the most part, adverbs of manner, only a few designating place. The arrangement of the adverbs as the extremes of the chiasmus is relatively more frequent than with temporal adverbs, this being their position in seven passages. In most instances the adverbs are strongly contrasted in meaning, as may be seen from the following passages: 24, 25, 8 aut servit humiliter aut superbe dominatur; 28, 8, 3 utrum a se audacius an fugacius ab hostibus geratur bellum; 34, 13, 9 nationem rebellantem magis temere quam constanter bellantem. There is a repetition of the adverb 25, 19, 12 id non promissum magis stolidè quam stolidè creditum; and of the sense 41, 7, 9 utrum susceptum sit nequius an inconsultius gestum, dici non posse. In 27, 1, 13 cum tredecim millia alibi, alibi haud plus quam septem inveniam, the adverbs refer to the sources of Livy's statement. The other passages containing adverbs of place are 3, 1, 7 poscere Romae agrum malle quam alibi accipere; 3, 66, 1 nec seditionem domi nec foris bellum acceperunt, 4, 35, 3 annum insequentem, neque bello foris neque domi

seditione insignem, the pairs of words being arranged in different order in the two statements, and 34, 7, 2 magistratus in provinciis municipiisque, hic Romae infimo generi . . . permittemus.

The pairs of words are usually contrasted in meaning in the passages in which the adverbs form the extremes: 1, 37, 6 male gesta res erat nec gesturos melius; 23, 20, 9 nihil raptim nec temere agendum consulendumque de integro censuit; 24, 14, 3 libertatem tacite mereri quam postulare palam maluerant; 37, 52, 7 ne quid aut immoderate cupisse aut petisse parum modeste videri posset; 39, 25, 14 haec acerbe postremi, cum priores leniter permulsissent iram.

The passages quoted have, in the main, been short, and illustrate fairly well the entire mass of examples. The inversion of the order of the words in the first member brings the two adverbs together, and renders the contrast stronger. The temporal contrast seems to have been the strongest, and even pronouns which are usually the means are sometimes crowded to the extremes, as in 21, 44, 4 ad supplicium depoposcerunt me ducem primum, deinde vos omnes. A single passage 37, 19, 7 evastatis Elaeensium primum, deinde Pergamenorum agris, will illustrate the use of chiasmus within the parts of an ablative absolute.

ADJECTIVES.

Chiasmus, formed by pairs of nouns with adjectives, was noticed in 154 passages, and in 113 of these the adjectives are attributive. They are placed together with about the same frequency as are the nouns (80:74), a difference not so great as to indicate any preference for the former arrangement.

While there is in many of the examples a sharp contrast in the meaning of the terms, there is often none at all, as can be seen by the quotations which represent the majority of the passages: 2, 46, 1 in tam inritatis animis et occasione ancipi; 6, 24, 7 insignis triumphis, etiam aetate venerabilis; 3, 29, 5 cum carmine triumphali et sollemnibus iocis; 3, 54, 3 truci ingenio et invidia praecipua; 7, 4, 7 vita agresti et rustico cultu. Though the examples of this type are the

more numerous, there still remains a goodly number in which there is a chiastic arrangement of terms opposed in meaning. Following sections contain examples showing this, the nouns being placed as the means, and those with attributive adjectives are quoted first:

1. **Adj. Noun × Noun Adj.** — 1, 18, 4 non tam peregrinis artibus quam disciplina tetrica ac tristi veterum Sabinorum ; 2, 17, 2 magis iam inexpiabili odio quam spe aliqua aut occasione ; 6, 20, 12 et eximiae gloriae monumentum et poenae ultimae fuit ; 7, 2, 3 et cum vis mōrbi nec humanis consiliis nec ope divina levaretur ; 27, 20, 3 serum post male gestam rem auxilium, consilio . . . haud parum opportuni ; 21, 4, 1 ne quandoque parvus hic ignis incendium ingens exsuscitet ; 22, 14, 5 non vicinus Samnis urit, sed Poenus advena ; 23, 18, 11 perdidere nimia bona ac voluptates immodicæ ; 35, 10, 5 maior gloria Scipionis . . . Quinti recentior ; 45, 40, 3 inops pecuniae Philippus, Perseus contra praedives. It is to be noticed that in a part of these examples the contrast is formally expressed by comparative particles.

In several passages the nouns are modified by numerals, as in 7, 25, 8 quaternum milium et ducenorum peditum equitumque trecentorum, and also (8, 8, 4) ; 22, 49, 18 ; 28, 8, 7 ; 28, 31, 7 ; 32, 9, 6 ; 33, 3, 9 ; 35, 43, 3 ; 38, 12, 8.

In the following the contrast is not indicated by the form of the statement : 6, 34, 8 nec satis piam adversus sororem nec admodum in virum honorificam ; 7, 31, 6 praepotens opibus populus, luxuria superbiaque clarus ; 7, 34, 3 aditu arduum impedito agmini, expeditis haud difficilem ; 8, 29, 10 par nobile rebus . . . discordia tamen . . . nobilius ; 22, 12, 12 ferox rapidusque consiliis ac lingua immodicus ; 27, 1, 7 par audacia Romanus, consilio et viribus impar ; 27, 20, 4 ignaram adhuc Romanorum esse, eoque Carthaginiensibus satis fidam censebat ; 28, 17, 8 res tum prosperae ubique Romanis, Poenis autem in Italia adversae ; 39, 37, 15 parum est victis quod victoribus satis est ; 45, 36, 4 asperiorem bellantibus eandem victoribus inopem.

2. **Noun Adj. × Adj. Noun.** — The passages in which the adjectives are placed together are like those quoted in the

last section, though they are not usually formally contrasted : 1, 23, 9 non contenti libertate certa in dubiam imperii servitique aleam imus ; 4, 10, 8 aequavit . . . consul togatus armati gloriam collegae ; 4, 13, 1 rem utilem pessimo exemplo ; 4, 24, 4 alios magistratus annuos esse, quinquennalem censuram ; 7, 20, 8 movit populum non tam causa praesens quam vetus meritum ; 24, 6, 7 finis regni Syracusani ac Punici imperii ; 24, 25, 6 animos eis regios regias coniuges fecisse ; 25, 38, 18 in rebus asperis et tenui spe ; 26, 45, 1 vis magna ex ingenti copia ; 30, 13, 11 hospitia privata et publica foedera ; 30, 36, 3 ad suam veteranam nova Lentuli classe adiuncta ; 38, 53, 6 quod rem publicam privatis simultatibus potiorem habuisset ; 35, 23, 11 Eumeni absenti et praesenti Attalo gratiae actae ; 36, 43, 12 quattuor et viginti navibus tectis, apertis pluribus paulo ; 38, 50, 7 Roma victrix victorem Africanum expellat (victa Carthago victum Hannibalem immediately precedes) ; 40, 46, 12 amicitias immortales, *mortales* inimici-tias. Three instances of nouns modified by numerals were noticed : 26, 14, 6 ; 29, 15, 7 ; and 35, 23, 11 equi duo, bina equestria arma. The remaining examples are of the same general character, though the adjectives are not attributive : 3, 9, 12 nobis miserum, invidiosum vobis ; 3, 41, 8 minus in bono constans quam navum in malitia ingenium ; 6, 34, 5 filiae duae nuptiae, Ser. Sulpicio maior, minor C. Licinio Stoloni erat ; 9, 32, 9 fugae minus nec plus caedis ; 27, 17, 11 nomen execrabile veteribus sociis, novis suspectum ; 35, 1, 5 numero impar, superior aliis ; 36, 7, 17 sicut ad belli munera pauci sumus, sic nimis multi pro inopia commeatum ; 37, 35, 8 legato magna . . . parva Romanis visa ; 45, 13, 13 quae rebus grata erant, gratiora verbis.

An infinitive is dependent on the adjective in 24, 22, 9 facile esse momento . . . cedere possessione magnae fortunae, facere et parare eam difficile atque arduum esse ; and in 39, 40, 2 a succession of patrician names is followed by *patricii, plebeii autem*, with the names of the plebeians. Cf. 26, 11, 5 duae, parva magnaque, res : magna . . . parva ; and 28, 1, 2 Romani Poenique : Hasdrubal . . . Scipionis.

PRONOUNS.

All classes of pronouns are fairly well represented, those of the first and second person occurring in the speeches. The pronouns generally form the means in the chiasmus, and the juxtaposition adds force to the contrast designed. The clauses in which the pronouns are found are usually short, so that the pronouns are brought close together, though there is a more elaborate chiastic arrangement 39, 53, 3 nam etsi minor aetate quam Perseus esset, hunc iusta matre familiae, illum paelice ortum esse; illum ut ex vulgato corpore genitum nullam certi patris notam habere, hunc insignem Philippi similitudinem prae se ferre; and 45, 41, 10 et cum ego et Perseus . . . ille . . . ego.

1. **Personal and Possessive.**—3, 67, 10 victi nos aequiore animo quiescimus quam vos victores; 7, 40, 10 vos prius in me strinxeritis ferrum quam in vos ego; 7, 13, 6 priusquam expertus nos essemus, de nobis desperasti; 23, 9, 8 valeant preces apud te meae, sicut pro te hodie valuerunt; 30, 30, 8 nec in Italia solum vobis bellum, nobis in Africa esset; 6, 40, 8 quod petunt alii, nos . . . fastidimus. The opposite arrangement with principal and subordinate clause is found 3, 65, 11 ita se quisque extollit ut deprimat alium. Possessive pronouns with chiastic arrangement occur with about the same frequency, and these, too, are usually the means of the chiasmus: 5, 54, 3 iniuriae vestrae meaeque calamitatis; 25, 12, 10 (in the prophecy of the bard Marcius) nam is divus extinguget perduellis vestros, qui vestros campos pascit placide; 28, 29, 3 corpus meum . . . vestras mentes; 30, 30, 18 in bonis tuis rebus, nostris dubiis; 45, 23, 16 non tam viribus nostris, quam vestris honoribus ac iudiciis; 45, 41, 12 hanc cladem domus meae vestra felicitas . . . consolatur; 25, 8, 8 leges suasque omnia. Here will be placed those passages in which the genitive of pronouns of other classes are opposed to the possessives: 26, 40, 7 favorem eius sua insuper invidia auxit; 27, 32, 6 raptus ab suis atque alteri equo iniectus; 2, 3, 3 quaerentes libertatem aliorum in suam vertisse servitatem; 7, 33, 3 haud minus libertatis alienae quam suae dignitatis

memor; 29, 37, 11 famam alterius, cum suae famae damno factum sit. The pronouns form the extremes in 28, 39, 1 vestra merita imperatorumque vestrorum, and 39, 28, 10 aut meo iure aut beneficio vestro.

2. **Demonstrative and Indefinite.** — The examples of demonstrative pronouns arranged in chiasmus have *hic* and *ille* as the means: 1, 13, 2 nepotum illi, hi liberum progeniem; 6, 40, 11 L. Sextium illum atque hunc C. Licinium; 34, 46, 12 quartae hic, ille secundae legionis; 40, 6, 4 robore ille, hic flore; and with variation of form in the two members 1, 53, 1 ni degeneratum in aliis, huic quoque decori offecisset. Arrangement of the pronouns as the extremes is illustrated by 22, 39, 8 bellum hoc genus, hostem hunc ignoro; 28, 41, 4 illud bellum . . . victoria illa; 5, 8, 11 huius adrogantiam pertinacia alterius aequavit; and 23, 45, 1 eodem se duce, milite alio. Instances of chiasmus with an indefinite pronoun in one member are found 34, 52, 5 caelata pleraque, quaedam eximiae artis; 37, 10, 12 subducit quasdam naves, alias velut subducturus esset; and 45, 10, 14 excesserunt . . . quidam, alii mortem sibi consciverunt.

3. **Pronominal Adjectives.** — The examples of the chiastic arrangement of *alius* and *alter*, the latter also with *unus*, are alike, and only a few need be quoted: 1, 24, 3 foedera alia aliis legibus; 3, 21, 6; 4, 21, 9 cui Prisco alii, alii Structo fuisse cognomen tradunt; 22, 29, 3 caesis aliis, aliis circum-spectantibus; 31, 41, 12; 37, 11, 12; 45, 32, 5; 9, 40, 21 consulem alterum, alterum praetorem declaravit; 9, 46, 3; 23, 11, 9; 25, 27, 1; 30, 40, 6; 34, 9, 4. The passages containing *unus*, *alter* are in 1, 20, 3 duos flamines adiecit Marti unus, alterum Quirino; 22, 42, 11; 35, 41, 8; and 38, 40, 6 praecedere una iussa, altera cogere . . . agmen.

Instances are not infrequent in which the pronouns have nouns as corresponding terms in the other member of the chiasmus. The personal contrast is the same as with pronouns in both members, for the noun and the pronoun are pitted against each other in the chiasmus, though where the nouns do not designate persons, the position on the extremes also occurs. Retaining the same general form of presentation

as in the instances already given, the examples will show Livy's freedom in the use of chiasmus. 22, 29, 6 ferente Hannibale ab se Minucium, se ab Fabio victum ; 23, 9, 7 quem horret populus Romanus, tu sustinebis ? 45, 44, 20 non tam honorificam audientibus quam sibi deformem ; 45, 18, 2 victoriam Romanis, sibi libertatem. The opposite arrangement in 31, 24, 14 cum suis ardorem, tum pavorem hostibus iniecit, is due to the meaning of the nouns, while in other passages noun and pronoun are not strongly contrasted : 4, 18, 1 militiam aegre patiens satisque fidens sibi, poscere pugnam ; 8, 23, 6 Fregellas ex Volscis captas dirutasque ab se Romanus populus restituerit ; 22, 24, 10 bellum gerebat receperatque suos. A noun and possessive pronoun form the means in 7, 34, 6 aut fortuna populi Romani aut nostra virtus expediet ; 30, 25, 10 nec institutis populi Romani nec suis moribus ; and 41, 3, 7 si castra metu secundanorum amissa sua virtute recipiant. A different arrangement in a passage similar to the second of these is found in 33, 28, 10 and 25, 40, 1 ut non modo suam gloriam sed etiam maiestatem populi Romani augeret. The same order with contrasted nouns is found 8, 4, 7 virtute vestra deum benignitate ; 45, 23, 1 deum benignitate et virtute vestra ; and without contrast in 39, 49, 3 suo ipse casu et onere equi ; and 45, 4, 3 fani religione non viribus suis. In the remaining instances the pronouns form the means excepting when the other terms are more forcible : 9, 19, 7 arma clupeus sarisaeque illis ; Romanis scutum ; 42, 62, 7 et moderationis Persei et illorum pervicacis superbiae futuros testes ; 26, 24, 9 Asiae Attalus, hi Thracum et Illyriorum reges ; 7, 23, 10 cum ipsa cunctatio et his animos minuisset et auxisset hosti ; 41, 2, 8 armati *alii*, maior pars inermis ; 37, 54, 26 aliae prius cum Philippo et cum Pyrrho Tarentini. An adjective may also be one term in the chiasmus as in 1, 25, 3 nec his nec illis periculum suum, publicum imperium servitiumque observatur animo.

NOUNS.

Under this head will be presented chiasms formed by pairs of nouns which stand in various case relations to each other.

The construction of corresponding terms is not always strictly parallel, though the instances are few in which it is not.

A. Nouns with Genitives.

The genitives form the means (noun gen. × gen. noun) in a majority of the passages in which pairs of nouns with dependent genitives form chiasmus (67 : 51). However, when the governing noun is in the accusative, the opposite arrangement (gen. acc. × acc. gen.) is the prevailing one. Sharp contrast in the meaning of the nouns is less frequent than in the parts of speech already considered, and for this reason only a few of the most striking examples will be quoted, showing the different arrangements of the genitive with other cases: 3, 6, 8 adfecti plerique principum, patrum maior pars; 4, 60, 7 primores plebis, nobilium amici; 9, 36, 6 sed neque commercium linguae nec vestis armorumve habitus eos texit; 9, 17, 3 militum copia et virtus, ingenia imperatorum; 44, 41, 1 imperii maiestas, gloria viri; 8, 39, 8 terrorem equitum peditumque vim; 40, 24, 6 parricidium fratris ac Didae scelus; 1, 52, 3 urbium excidia vastationesque agrorum; 38, 55, 8 malim equidem librarii mendum quam mendacium scriptoris esse; 45, 31, 4 adulando aut Romanorum imperium aut amicitiam regum; 2, 27, 12 consilio magis et auctoritate principum quam populi iussu; 4, 6, 5 cum Canuleius victoria de patribus, et plebis favore ingens esset; 3, 63, 11 tum primum sine auctoritate senatus populi iussu triumphatum est. Cf. similar statements 7, 17, 9; 21, 18, 10; 38, 51, 4; 4, 20, 1 senatus consulto iussu populi; 7, 13, 5 nobis deum benignitate, felicitate tua populique Romani, et res et gloria est integra.

B. Nouns without Genitives.

Successive pairs of nouns not containing genitives are relatively frequent, and most of the possible combinations of cases are represented by some clear-cut examples of chiasmus. The personal element is especially noticeable, and in most

instances the chiastic arrangement seems to be for the purpose of emphasizing this.

1. **Nominative and Dative.** — 5, 8, 13; 5, 32, 2 L. Lucretio et C. Aemilio Volsinienses provincia evenit, Sappinates Agrippae Furio et Ser. Sulpicio; 8, 37, 3; 10, 16, 5 quod pax servientibus gravior quam liberis bellum esset; 10, 39, 13 (subject acc.) spoliaque ea honestiora victori hosti quam ipsis arma fuisse; 21, 50, 10; 21, 57, 12; 40, 18, 3 Ligures consulibus, praetoribus Q. Petilio urbana, with five other divisions in regular order. The nominatives are the means in 23, 31, 9 Menti Otacilius, Fabius Veneri Erucinae; and 39, 25, 12 quo et Graecis Macedoniam colentibus metus et audacia Philippo minuatur.

2. **Nominative and Accusative.** — 1, 33, 2 cum . . . Sabini Capitolium atque arcem, Caelium montem Albani implessent; 3, 69, 10 cum ira Romanos, illos . . . conscientia . . . inritaret; 7, 3, 3 magis conquisitio animos quam corpora morbi adficerent; 26, 30, 12; 34, 45, 5 C. Laetorius Crotonem, Tempsam C. Cornelius Merula . . . deduxerunt; 33, 7, 2; 37, 39, 8 Romani medium aciem, cornua Latini tenuerunt; [41, 8, 3]. The cases are arranged in different order 1, 6, 4 Palatium Romulus, Remus Aventinum . . . capiunt; 3, 27, 6 legiones ipse dictator, magister equitum suos equites dicit; 7, 22, 4 profecti, Faliscum Quinctius, Sulpicius Tarquiniense; 35, 51, 8 Salganea Minippus, rex ipse castellum Euripi oppugnare est adortus; 41, 23, 12 graviores eos accolas Graecia habuisset, quam Asia Gallos habebat.

3. **Nominative and Locative.** — 24, 3, 16 Luceriae Sempronius consul, Hannibal haud procul Arpis hibernabat.

4. **Dative and Dative.** — 26, 2, 10 praesidio sociis, hostibus terrori essent.

5. **Dative and Accusative.** — 22, 9, 10 Iovi ludos magnos et aedes Veneri Erucinae ac Menti. 31, 24, 14 cum suis ardorem, tum pavorem hostibus iniecit (cf. 5, 7, 4 maestitiam omnibus, senatui curam . . . iniecit); 36, 8, 4 sibi commendationem . . . et invidiam regi. 4, 44, 9 nec tum agrum plebi, sed sibi invidiam quaeri; 30, 38, 12 laetitiam populo et ludis celebritatem addidit.

6. **Accusative and Ablative.** — 21, 45, 8 agnum laeva manu, dextra silicem retinens ; 33, 18, 9 and 10 ; 38, 15, 7 ad fluvium Taurum primo die, postero ad Xylinen ; 44, 45, 15 ; 7, 3, 1 aut religione animos aut corpora morbis levavit ; 33, 17, 10 et armis magis muros quam se ipsos moenibus tutari.

7. **Appositives.** — There are a few passages in which a chiastic arrangement of successive pairs of appositives is found. In some of these the parties are hostile, in others there seems to be emphasis placed upon the personal relationship, while in still others, the chiastic arrangement is perhaps incidental. 3, 44, 7 Vergini patris sponsique Acili ; 3, 56, 1 accusatorem primum Verginium et Appium reum deligunt ; 3, 61, 2 non Appio duce rem geri, sed consule Valerio ; 10, 22, 9 consules creati Q. Fabius et P. Decius, Ap. Claudius praetor ; 43, 4, 5 ; 8, 24, 17 devecta ad Cleopatram uxorem sororemque Olympiadem ; 39, 9, 2 sub tutela Duroniae matris et vitrici T. Semproni Rutili. 8, 24, 3 urbe Pandosia in Epiro et Acheronte amni ; 21, 29, 6 Boiorum legatorum regulique Magali adventus. 34, 8, 6 ; 38, 13, 3 ; 39, 17, 6.

8. **Nouns with Prepositional Phrases.** — In both members of the chiasmus are sometimes found prepositional phrases, which in a majority of the occurrences are placed as the means, and those so placed express either personal or local relations. The names of persons or classes form the means in 1, 13, 8 Ramnenses ab Romulo, ab Titio Titienses appellati ; 2, 57, 1 ; 4, 9, 14 firmiore se munimento ab Romanis circumvallatos quam ab se urbem viderent ; 7, 23, 1 M. Popilius Laenas a plebe consul, a patribus L. Cornelius Scipio datus ; 10, 17, 11 ; 30, 4, 6 consulitur Hasdrabul ab Syphace, ab Hannibale Carthaginenses ; 32, 39, 2. The names of nations are arranged in the same way in 2, 43, 5 ducendus Fabio in Veientes, in Aequos Furio datur ; 24, 44, 9 profecti consules Sempronius in Lucanos, in Apuliam Fabius ; and 26, 41, 21 eadem in illos ingruit fortuna . . . nam et deseruntur ab sociis, ut prius ab Celtiberis nos, though in the last example the statements are not exactly parallel. Phrases indicating place are found in 3, 38, 11 haud fere quisquam in foro, in urbe rari erant ; 33, 40, 2 Antiochus in Asia . . . in Italia

populus Romanus ; and 34, 9, 4 aperto mari ab altera parte, ab altera Hispanis. Phrases showing the source are found 1, 23, 1 Lavinium ab Troia, ab Lavinio Alba ; and 35, 18, 5 Nabim a Peloponneso concitaturum omnia . . . a Macedonia Philippum.

When the phrases form the extremes of the chiasmus, personal nouns are the means in 7, 25, 4 in castra Galli, Graeci retro ad naves ; 23, 44, 5 in urbem Romani, Poeni in castra receperunt sese ; and 34, 14, 10 ab sinistro cornu et a fronte urguebantur barbari et cohortes a tergo ; 45, 26, 7 cum maior a Romanis metus timorem a principibus suis vicisset. In the remaining passages the parts are strongly contrasted : 1, 52, 6 ut ex binis singulos faceret binosque ex singulis ; 2, 44, 2 in praesentia re, exemplo in perpetuum ; 8, 1, 10 in pace amicitiam . . . auxilium in bello ; 39, 16, 1 a facinoribus manus, mentem a fraudibus abstinuissent. In 3, 42, 3 fusi et ab Sabinis ad Eretum et in Algido ab Aequis exercitus erant, both members of the chiasmus are composed of prepositional phrases. Similar to this is 38, 3, 1 legatos et Romam ad senatum et ad Scipiones in Asiam . . . misit.

VERBS.

Pairs of verbs with nouns form 44 % of the entire number of chiasms, and the verbs are placed together in a majority of instances (298 : 255). The form of statement in the two members, generally parallel, is not always so, as in 1, 19, 1 conditam vi et armis, iure . . . condere parat ; 6, 23, 8 patere te vinci consilio, ut maturius bello vincas ; 6, 26, 7 etsi revicta rebus verbis confutare nihil attinet ; 9, 4, 16 redimite armis civitatem, quam auro maiores vestri redemerunt ; 30, 18, 1 decreta Romae et in Africa gesta sunt. As in these passages the members are not usually separated by intervening words, and the chiasmus in most instances results from the inversion of the order of the words in one of two coördinate statements. Owing to the number of examples and their general similarity, we shall quote only a few illustrative of the chiastic arrangement with different forms of the verb.

I. **Noun Verb × Verb Noun.** — 22, 6, 3 hostes summa vi

petebant et tuebantur cives ; 28, 19, 11 et victim saepe erigeret et adfligeret victorem ; 4, 15, 7 ab deis orti, recepti ad deos ; 33, 22, 1 senatum habentibus postulantibusque triumphum ; 1, 35, 6 nec minus regni sui firmandi quam augendae rei publicae memor ; 24, 18, 2 ad mores hominum regendos animum adverterunt castigandaque vitia ; 27, 13, 12 edicere iam sese omnibus pugnandum . . . et adnitendum singulis universisque ; 21, 51, 1 Hierone cum classe regia dimisso relictoque praetore ; 22, 19, 7 strepitu . . . exaudito aut aperientibus classem promunturiis ; 24, 47, 1 imbre conquiescente et propinqua luce.

2. Verb Noun × Noun Verb. — 3, 61, 7 praestate virtute peditem, ut honore atque ordine praestatis ; 6, 36, 5 obsidebantur haud paulo vi maiore Velitrae quam Tusculum obsessum fuerat ; 30, 26, 8 superavit paternos honores, avitos aequavit ; 36, 35, 7 reservari eam Achaei, Elei maluerunt contribui ; 5, 44, 2 invictus bello in pace . . . pulsus sum ; 35, 19, 1 suspectus regi, in nullo honore habitus ; 2, 19, 10 ira ob erepta bona patriamque ademptam ; 3, 37, 2 avide ruendo ad libertatem in servitutem elapsos iuvare nolle ; 26, 12, 14 conferundo cum hoste castra, fortunam temptando ; 22, 28, 9 deposcere pellendos inde hostes ac locum capiendum ; 25, 15, 12 pugnantibus Romanis, Thuringis expectantibus ; 33, 21, 6 terminato bello, pace perpetrata ; 44, 9, 6 stantibus primis, secundis summissoribus ; 3, 25, 6 venerunt questum iniurias et ex foedere res repetitum. With these may also be placed 2, 4, 3 tempus . . . consultando absumunt evincuntque instando.

The words in the two members of the chiasmus are opposite in meaning or strongly contrasted in only a small number of the instances. A few examples will be given : 34, 25, 12 occisi plures, pauci coniecti ; 25, 11, 16 quae impedita natura sunt, consilio expediuntur ; 34, 58, 3 tueri quas habeant et novas complecti ; 1, 9, 4 et deos adfuisse et non defuturam virtutem ; 3, 52, 8 aut plebs non est habenda, aut habendi sunt tribuni. The mass, however, of the examples express unemphatic coördinate actions, and the chiasm merely adds a slight rhetorical coloring to the statement. The presence

or the absence of connectives does not seem to have any influence on the arrangement. Asyndetic collocations are more numerous than those connected by either *et* or *-que*. A few representative passages from the second book will be quoted to show the varying phases of Livy's usage : 23, 8 se undique in publicum proripiunt, implorant Quiritium fidem ; 25, 6 data pax, ager ademptus ; 2, 8, 8 precationem peragit et dedicat templum ; 27, 1 qui ante necti fuerant, creditoribus tradebantur et nectebantur alii ; 38, 4 violaturi simus ludos piaculumque merituri ; 45, 2 lenitum iras sanitatemque animis adlaturum ; 59, 7 ut neque imperia exaudiri neque instrui acies posset ; 61, 5 ut vestem mutaret aut supplex prensaret homines ; 60, 5 aut plebi additum est aut demptum patribus.

THREE OR MORE PAIRS OF WORDS.

When there are three or more pairs of words the monotony of the anaphoric arrangement is sometimes interrupted by chiasmus. The continuation of the narrative by the introduction of several coördinate groups is not a prominent feature in the style of Livy, and, as a result, the number of examples of chiasmus is relatively small, being the most numerous with pairs of nouns with verbs.

I. **Adjectives and Nouns.** — In 5, 37, 8 truci cantu clamoribusque variis horrendo cuncta compleverant sono, the reversal of the order of words in the second group gives two instances of chiasmus. In 10, 31, 8, and 9, 7, 3 silentium illud obstinatum fixosque in terram oculos et surdas ad omnia solacia aures, the chiasmus is between the first and second groups. There are three instances, 30, 15, 11 aurea corona, aurea patera, sella curuli et scipione eburno, toga picta et palmata tunica donat ; 21, 22, 4 quinquaginta quinqueremes, quadriremes duae, triremes quinque ; sed aptae instructaeque remigio triginta et duae quinqueremes, erant et triremes quinque ; and 38, 38, 18 de Hannibale Poeno et Aetolo Thoante et Mnasilocho Acarnane et Chalcidensibus Eubulida et Philone dedendis. In the account of six pulvinaria 22, 10, 9 there is chiasmus between the first and second groups,

Iovi ac Iunoni unum, alterum Neptuno ac Minervae, while the remaining four are arranged as is the second. The grouping of the words is especially noticeable, 44, 39, 1 at hercule aciem quidem inconditam inordinatamque habuisse-mus; castra munita, provisam aquationem, tutum ad eam iter praesidiis impositis, explorata circa omnia, the order of words changing after *munita*, and the abl. abs. (noun part.) being inserted between *iter* and *explorata*.

2. Nouns with Nouns. — Three or more successive pairs of nouns are not of frequent occurrence. Four pairs are found, 5, 42, 4 quocumque clamor hostium, mulierum puerorumque ploratus, sonitus flammæ et fragor ruentium tectorum aver-tisset; and 8, 34, 1 stabat cum eo senatus maiestas favor populi tribinicium auxilium memoria absentis exercitus; 30, 34, 12. Three pairs were noticed, 3, 48, 7 scelus Appi, puellæ infelicem formam, necessitatem patris deplorant; 4, 15, 5; 5, 20, 3 deum . . . benignitate, suis consiliis, patientia militum; 28, 43, 12; 38, 15, 9 agri fecunditas et multitudo hominum et situs inter paucas munitæ urbis; 40, 34, 3; 41, 24, 8 vel viribus nostris, deum benignitate, vel regionis intervallo. Compare with this last 45, 23, 1 deum benignitate et virtute vestra, the order of the words in these pairs being the same as in the preceding sentence, but the relative order of the pairs is changed. The handling of other noun-combinations is similar. There are two instances of chiasmus in three pairs, 8, 6, 15 milites militibus, centurionibus centuriones, tribuni tribunis, and one 31, 21, 8 M. Furius dextrae alae, legionibus M. Caecilius, equitibus L. Valerius . . . praepositi. The order is changed in the last pair, 45, 16, 4, and 28, 38, 13 urbana Cn. Servilio obtigit, Ariminum Sp. Lucretio, Sicilia L. Aemilio, Cn. Octavio. In 25, 3, 4–6 five pairs of datives and nominatives are followed by three in reverse order, and a similar succession of nominatives and accusatives, the first two forming chiasmus, occurs 42, 31, 9 Siciliam C. Caninius Rebilus est sortitus, L. Furius Philus Sardiniam, *L. Canuleius Hispaniam*, C. Sul-picius Galba urbanam iurisdictionem, L. Villius Annalis inter peregrinos.

3. **Nouns with Verbs.**—The first of the passages here quoted have the order of the middle pair reversed, thus causing a double chiasm in each. 5, 6, 1 *victoria frui . . . pati taedium . . . exitum expectare*; 9, 32, 6 *clamor ab Etruscis oritur, concinuntque tubae et signa inferuntur*; 23, 16, 6 *impedimenta . . . diriperent, clauderent deinde portas murosque occuparent*; 26, 9, 7; 28, 26, 11; 28, 32, 9; 31, 30, 3 *sata exuri, dirui tecta, praedas . . . agi*. In a few others the chiasmus is between the second and the third pairs: 32, 31, 3 *populari agros et urere tecta vicosque expugnare coepit*; 44, 38, 8; 45, 22, 6 *Messana in Sicilia oppugnatae et Graecia in servitutem petita et adiutus Hannibal . . . Philippum hostem fecerunt*. Where there are more than three pairs, chiasmus occurs 2, 23, 5 *villa incensa fuerit, direpta omnia, pecora abacta, tributum . . . imperatum*; 3, 14, 5 *adloqui plebis homines, domum invitare, deesse in foro, tribunos . . . pati . . . habere*; 9, 31, 12 *victum acie, castris exutum, nudatum urbibus, ultimam spem . . . temptantem et loco, non armis fretum*; 30, 28, 11 *sese acie victos, Syphacem captum, pulsos se Hispania, pulsos Italia*; 31, 48, 11 *fusos caesosque hostis, castra capta ac direpta, coloniam liberatam obsidione . . . captivos recuperatos*; 40, 46, 8 *legatis senatum, equites recenseatis, agatis censum, lustrum condatis*.

GROUPS OF THREE OR MORE WORDS.

The use of groups of three or more words represents a form of rhetorical development differing somewhat from that discussed in previous sections. The introduction of additional modifying elements more widely separates corresponding terms in the successive groups, and the juxtaposition of the emphatic words requires a correspondingly greater divergence from the ordinary arrangement. With successive groups of three words the relative order is sometimes completely reversed, as in 3, 54, 3 *odium in se aliorum suo in eos metiens odio*; 7, 37, 2 *milites . . . dupli frumento in perpetuum, in praesentia bubus privis binisque tunicis donati*; 3, 33, 8 *qui consensus privatis interdum inutilis est, summa adversus alios*

equitas erat ; 9, 12, 3 ut clariorem inter Romanos deditio Postumium quam Pontium incruenta Victoria inter Samnites faceret ; 10, 13, 7 nec honores magnos fortissimis viris Romae nec honoribus deesse fortes viros ; 28, 8, 6 reddidit inde Achaeis Heraeam et Triphyliam ; Alipheram autem Megalopolitis . . . restituit ; 42, 62, 11 in adversis voltum secundae fortunae gerere, moderari animos in Secundis ; 45, 22, 4 nec cuiusquam fortunae invidemus, immo agnoscimus clementiam populi Romani. However, in most of the groups which form chiasmus, one word retains its regular position in both members, and the relative order of the others is changed. Adverbs, pronouns, and verbs most frequently illustrate this type :

1. **Adverbs.** — 2, 10, 8 nunc singulos provocare, nunc increpare omnes ; 42, 59, 3 ; 2, 44, 9 partim patrum consiliis, partim patientia plebis ; 5, 43, 5 ; 2, 46, 2 hinc contumeliis hostes, hinc consules mora exacerbaverant ; 3, 11, 6 ferox iuvenis qua nobilitate gentis, qua corporis magnitudine et viribus ; 8, 4, 5 ubi pars virium, ibi et imperii pars est ; 37, 25, 1 prius Victoriae nuntius, deinde adventus Rhodiorum. Similarly with correlative particles as in 4, 31, 7 sicut legatorum ante, ita tum novorum colonorum caede inbutis armis.

2. **Pronouns.** — 1, 12, 9 Aliud esse origines rapere, aliud pugnare cum viris ; 9, 45, 11 alii exeendum in aciem, alii castra tuenda censem ; 35, 12, 14 haec Philippo Nicander, alii Dicaearchus Antiocho ; 8, 11, 7 funesta duo consulum praetoria, alterum parricidio filii, alterum consulis devoti caede ; 27, 35, 10 alteri adversus Hannibalem Brutii Lucani, alteri adversus Hasdrubalem ; 28, 6, 11 ; 41, 20, 5 quidam ludere eum simpliciter, quidam haud dubie insanire aiebant ; 42, 45, 5.

3. **Verbs.** — 1, 25, 13 imperio alteri aucti, alteri dicionis facti ; 3, 31, 8 iussi inclitas leges Solonis describere et aliarum Graeciae civitatum instituta, mores iuraque noscere ; 2, 19, 8 bracchium Aebutio traiectum sit, Mamilio pectus percussum ; 23, 45, 9 qui pauci plures vincere soliti estis, nunc paucis plures vix restatis.

The arrangement of the words in these examples illustrates the technical construction of the remainder, — two corresponding words retaining the same relative position in each. The

remaining 81 instances represent the combinations in threes of the different parts of speech, and can be sufficiently illustrated by one or two examples of each of the different combinations: 28, 6, 6 nec fuga effuse petita, nec pertinaciter proelium initum. 37, 25, 12 suus primum furor, deinde fraus Aetolorum; 4, 41, 1 non suis vana laudibus, non crimine alieno laeta. 1, 2, 6 secundum inde proelium Latinis, Aeneae etiam ultimum mortalium operum. 21, 57, 6 opere magno munitum et valido firmatum praesidio. 5, 11, 6 fugam Sergi Verginius, Sergius proditionem increpans Vergini; 7, 13, 4 virtute culpam nostram corrigere et abolere flagitii memoriam nova gloria. 21, 50, 4 et Romanis multitudo sua auxit animum et paucitas illis minuit; 28, 7, 11 Opuntem Attalus ceperat, Philippus Thronum cepit; 35, 29, 1 Telemnastus Cretensis popularibus suis, equitibus Lycortas Megalopolitanus praeeerat. 1, 1, 9 foedus ictum inter duces, inter exercitus salutationem factam. 31, 7, 6 patiamur expugnandis Athenis, sicut Sagunto expugnando Hannibalem passi sumus; 24, 26, 4 neque fortunam suam eandem vivo Hieronymo fuisse quam sororis neque imperfecto eo causam eandem esse. 32, 40, 3 praeberi debere dicebat rex, tyranus negavit deducaturum.

The following illustrate the extension of the chiastic arrangement to more than three groups: 28, 8, 3 sic ab Opunte Attalum, sic Sulpicium ab Chalcide, sic . . . Machanidam e manibus suis elapsum; 2, 61, 6 idem habitus oris, eadem contumacia in vultu, idem in oratione spiritus erat; 32, 9, 2 de caelo tacta erant via publica Veis, forum et aedes Iovis Lanuvi, Herculis aedes Ardeae, Capuae murus.

Eight passages were noticed in which words in successive groups of four each have a chiastic arrangement: 2, 9, 8 nec quisquam unus malis artibus postea tam popularis esset quam tum bene imperando universus senatus fuit; 10, 2, 2 Thuriae redditae veteri cultori, Sallentinoque agro pax parta; 10, 13, 7 et se gloriae seniorum subcrevisse, et ad suam gloriam consurgententes alios laetum aspicere; 10, 39, 11 multa de universo genere belli multa de praesenti hostium apparatu . . . disseruit; 25, 18, 10 nihil sibi cum eo consociatum, nihil foedera-

tum hosti cum hoste; 39, 31, 2 Hispanis recenti victoria ferocibus et insueta ignominia milite Romano incenso; 40, 5, 11 tantum in externis auxiliis est praesidii, quantum periculi *in* fraude domestica; 45, 5, 11 ab illo Delphis vulneratum Eumenen, ab se Samothracae Euandrum occisum. Chiasmus in still longer groups is found 4, 56, 4 seu Carventana arx retenta in spem, seu Verrugine amissum praesidium ad iram cum impulisset; 28, 24, 2 apparuit quantam excitatura molem vera fuisset clades, cum vanus rumor tantas procellas excivisset; 10, 27, 10 adversus Samnites Q. Fabius primam ac tertiam legionem pro dextro cornu, adversus Gallos pro sinistro Decius quintam et sextam instruxit; 38, 51, 11 vos aetatem meam honoribus vestris anteistis, ego vestros honores rebus gerendis praecessi.

CLAUSES.

In a few passages, successive clauses do not preserve the same relative order. In 28, 29, 4 and 29, 12, 7 cupiens pacem, si posset, si minus, indurias, the affirmative and negative parts of a conditional statement are placed together, and with the affirmative parts on the extremes 30, 30, 21 non tantum . . . si proelio vincas, gloriae adieceris, quantum ademeris, si quid adversi eveniat. In connection with a condition, the pronouns form chiasmus in 21, 13, 2 cum ille aut vestra aut sua culpa manserit apud hostem — sua, si metum simulavit, vestra, si periculum est apud vos vera referentibus —. Other occurrences are in 5, 54, 3 quae vos, Quirites, nunc moveant potius caritate sua, ut maneatus in sede vestra, quam postea, cum reliqueritis eam, macerant desiderio; 23, 13, 4 tum pacem speratis, cum vincemur, quam nunc, cum vincimus, nemo dat; 23, 42, 13 quos ut socios haberet, dignos duxisti, haud indigos iudicas quos in fidem receptos tuearis; 34, 4, 16 ne *eas* simul pudere, quod non oportet, cooperit, quod oportet, non pudebit. A good example is in 30, 18, 4 itaque vel tu ad prima signa proelium sustine, ego inducam in pugnam equites; vel ego hic in prima acie rem geram, tu quattuor legionum equites in hostem emitte. In this the two futures with *ego* are placed as the means of the chiasmus, while the two

imperatives with *tū* are on the extremes. In 39, 36, 13-14 two causal clauses form chiasmus: *nostrum est, quod evocavimus . . . ; quod . . . interfecti sunt, vestrum est.*

As may be seen from the examples collected, chiasmus is found chiefly with two pairs of words, though at times there may be a greater number of these. Change in the relative order of words in groups of three is less common, and in longer groups does not frequently occur. The position occupied by some of the parts of speech in chiasmus is quite definitely fixed, adverbs, pronouns, and nouns designating persons being generally placed as the means, as are the most strongly contrasted words in pairs of adjectives and nouns. In the examples classed under "Nouns" and "Verbs" the corresponding terms are not usually strongly contrasted, yet, as there is a marked tendency to arrange together contrasted terms, it is safe to assume that to these also chiasmus adds some rhetorical coloring.

A comparison of the examples collected of anaphora and chiasmus shows that the normal usage with the different parts of speech in these figures widely differs. Adverbs, nouns, and verbs, freely used in chiasmus, are but rarely anaphoric, an arrangement common for attributives which are relatively not so freely used in chiasmus. Though not used in chiasmus, relative and interrogative pronouns, and several classes of particles are of common occurrence in anaphora whose elements are, as a whole, attributive and introductory, while in chiasmus they are independent, and a factor in interior sentence decoration. Both are employed for the sake of emphasis. Anaphora, emphasizing by repetition, is one of the most marked rhetorical features of the speeches, while chiasmus, indicating emphasis by variation from the normal arrangement, produces the most marked effects in the juxtaposition of strongly contrasted terms, and yet to plain narrative imparts somewhat of a rhetorical tinge.